

# An $O(k^3 \log n)$ -Approximation Algorithm for Vertex-Connectivity Survivable Network Design

Julia Chuzhoy\*      Sanjeev Khanna†

December 23, 2008

## Abstract

In the Survivable Network Design problem (SNDP), we are given an undirected graph  $G(V, E)$  with costs on edges, along with a connectivity requirement  $r(u, v)$  for each pair  $u, v$  of vertices. The goal is to find a minimum-cost subset  $E^*$  of edges, that satisfies the given set of pairwise connectivity requirements. In the edge-connectivity version we need to ensure that there are  $r(u, v)$  edge-disjoint paths for every pair  $u, v$  of vertices, while in the vertex-connectivity version the paths are required to be vertex-disjoint. The edge-connectivity version of SNDP is known to have a 2-approximation. However, no non-trivial approximation algorithm has been known so far for the vertex version of SNDP, except for special cases of the problem. We present an extremely simple algorithm to achieve an  $O(k^3 \log n)$ -approximation for this problem, where  $k$  denotes the maximum connectivity requirement, and  $n$  denotes the number of vertices. We also give a simple proof of the recently discovered  $O(k^2 \log n)$ -approximation result for the single-source version of vertex-connectivity SNDP. We note that in both cases, our analysis in fact yields slightly better guarantees in that the  $\log n$  term in the approximation guarantee can be replaced with a  $\log \tau$  term where  $\tau$  denotes the number of distinct vertices that participate in one or more pairs with a positive connectivity requirement.

---

\*Toyota Technological Institute, Chicago, IL 60637. Email: [cjulia@tti-c.org](mailto:cjulia@tti-c.org).

†Dept. of Computer & Information Science, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA 19104. Email: [sanjeev@cis.upenn.edu](mailto:sanjeev@cis.upenn.edu). Supported in part by a Guggenheim Fellowship, an IBM Faculty Award, and by NSF Award CCF-0635084.

# 1 Introduction

In the Survivable Network Design problem (SNDP), we are given an undirected graph  $G(V, E)$  with costs on edges, and a connectivity requirement  $r(u, v)$  for each pair  $u, v$  of vertices. The goal is to find a minimum cost subset  $E^*$  of edges, such that each pair  $(u, v)$  of vertices is connected by  $r(u, v)$  paths. In the edge-connectivity version (EC-SNDP), these paths are required to be edge-disjoint, while in the vertex-connectivity version (VC-SNDP), they need to be vertex-disjoint. It is not hard to show that EC-SNDP can be cast as a special case of VC-SNDP. We denote by  $n$  the number of vertices in the graph and by  $k$  the maximum pairwise connectivity requirement, that is,  $\max_{u, v \in V} \{r(u, v)\}$ . We also define a subset  $T \subseteq V$  of vertices called *terminals*: a vertex  $u \in T$  iff  $r(u, v) > 0$  for some vertex  $v \in V$ .

The best current approximation algorithm for EC-SNDP is due to Jain [13], and it achieves a factor-2 approximation via the iterative rounding technique. At the same time no non-trivial approximation algorithms have been known for VC-SNDP, with the exception of several restricted special cases. Agrawal et. al. [1] showed a 2-approximation algorithm for the special case where maximum connectivity requirement  $k = 1$ . For  $k = 2$ , a 2-approximation algorithm was given by Fleischer [9]. The  $k$ -vertex connected spanning subgraph problem, a special case of VC-SNDP where for all  $u, v \in V$   $r_{u,v} = k$ , has been studied extensively. Cheriyan *et al.* [2, 3] gave an  $O(\log k)$ -approximation algorithm for this case when  $k \leq \sqrt{n/6}$ , and an  $O(\sqrt{n/\epsilon})$ -approximation algorithm for  $k \leq (1 - \epsilon)n$ . For large  $k$ , Kortsarz and Nutov [17] improved the preceding bound to an  $O(\ln k \cdot \min\{\sqrt{k}, \frac{n}{n-k} \ln k\})$ -approximation. Fakcharoenphol and Laekhanukit [8] improved it to an  $O(\log n \log k)$ -approximation, and further obtained an  $O(\log^2 k)$ -approximation for  $k < n/2$ . Very recently, Nutov [20] improved this to  $O(\log k \cdot \log \frac{n}{n-k})$ -approximation.

Kortsarz et. al. [15] showed that VC-SNDP is hard to approximate to within a factor of  $2^{\log^{1-\epsilon} n}$  for any  $\epsilon > 0$ , when  $k$  is polynomially large in  $n$ . This result was subsequently extended by Chakraborty et. al. [4] to a  $k^\epsilon$ -hardness for all  $k > k_0$ , where  $k_0$  and  $\epsilon$  are fixed positive constants. The existence of good approximation algorithms for small values of  $k$  has remained an open problem, even for  $k \geq 3$ . In particular, when each connectivity requirement  $r_{u,v} \in \{0, 3\}$ , the best known approximation factor is polynomially large while only an APX-hardness is known on the hardness side.

A special case of VC-SNDP that has received much attention recently is the single-source version. In this problem there is a special vertex  $s$  called the *source*, and all non-zero connectivity requirements involve  $s$ , that is, if  $u \neq s$  and  $v \neq s$ , then  $r(u, v) = 0$ . Kortsarz et. al [15] showed that even this restricted special case of VC-SNDP is hard to approximate up to factor  $\Omega(\log n)$ , and recently Lando and Nutov [18] improved this to  $(\log n)^{2-\epsilon}$ -hardness of approximation for any constant  $\epsilon > 0$ . Both results only hold when  $k$  is polynomially large in  $n$ . On the algorithmic side, Chakraborty et. al. [4] showed an  $2^{O(k^2)} \log^4 n$ -approximation for the problem. This result was later independently improved to  $O(k^{O(k)} \log n)$ -approximation by Chekuri and Korula [5], and to  $O(k^2 \log n)$  by

Chuzhoy and Khanna [7], and by Nutov [19]. Recently, Chekuri and Korula [6] simplified the analysis of the algorithm of [7]. We note that for the uniform case, where all non-zero connectivity requirements are  $k$ , Chuzhoy and Khanna [7] show a slightly better  $O(k \log n)$ -approximation algorithm, and the results of [6] extend to this special case.

A closely related problem to EC-SNDP and VC-SNDP is the element-connectivity SNDP. The input to the element-connectivity SNDP is the same as for EC-SNDP and VC-SNDP, and we also define the set  $T \subseteq V$  of terminals as above. Given a problem instance, an *element* is any edge or any non-terminal vertex in the graph. We say that a pair  $(s, t)$  of vertices is  *$k$ -element connected* iff for every subset  $X$  of at most  $(k - 1)$  elements,  $s$  and  $t$  remain connected by a path when  $X$  is removed from the graph. In other words, there are  $k$  element-disjoint paths connecting  $s$  to  $t$ ; these paths are allowed to share terminals. Observe that if  $(s, t)$  are  $k$ -vertex connected, then they are also  $k$ -element connected, and similarly, if  $(s, t)$  are  $k$ -element connected, then they are also  $k$ -edge connected. The goal in the element-connectivity SNDP is to select a minimum-cost subset  $E^*$  of edges, such that in the graph induced by  $E^*$ , each pair  $(u, v)$  of vertices is  $r(u, v)$ -element connected. The element-connectivity SNDP was introduced in [14] as a problem of intermediate difficulty between edge-connectivity and vertex-connectivity, and the authors gave a primal-dual  $O(\log k)$ -approximation for this problem. Subsequently, Fleischer *et al.* [10] gave a 2-approximation algorithm for element-connectivity SNDP via the iterative rounding technique, matching the 2-approximation guarantee of Jain [13] for EC-SNDP. We will use this result as a building block for our algorithm.

**Our results:** Our main result is as follows.

**Theorem 1** *There is a polynomial-time randomized  $O(k^3 \log n)$ -approximation algorithm for VC-SNDP, where  $k$  denotes the largest pairwise connectivity requirement.*

In fact, our analysis gives a slightly better approximation guarantee of  $O(k^3 \log |T|)$ . The proof of this result is based on a randomized reduction that maps a given instance of VC-SNDP to a family of instances of element-connectivity SNDP. The reduction creates  $O(k^3 \log n)$  instances, and has the property that any collection of edges that is feasible for *each one* of the element-connectivity SNDP instances generated above, is a feasible solution for the given VC-SNDP instance. We can thus use the known 2-approximation algorithm for element-connectivity SNDP to obtain the desired result.

We use these ideas to also give an alternative simple proof of the  $O(k^2 \log n)$ -approximation algorithm for the single-source VC-SNDP problem.

**Organization:** We present the proof of Theorem 1 in Section 2. Section 3 presents an alternative proof of the  $O(k^2 \log n)$ -approximation result for single-source VC-SNDP.

## 2 The Algorithm for VC-SNDP

Recall that in the VC-SNDP problem we are given an undirected graph  $G(V, E)$  with costs on edges, and a connectivity requirement  $r(u, v) \leq k$  for all  $u, v \in V$ . Additionally, we have a subset  $T \subseteq V$  of terminals, and  $r(u, v) > 0$  only if  $u, v \in T$ . Pairs of terminals with non-zero connectivity requirements are called *source-sink pairs*. We will use  $\text{OPT}$  to denote the cost of an optimal solution to the given VC-SNDP instance.

Our algorithm is as follows. We create  $p$  copies of our original graph, say  $G_1, G_2, \dots, G_p$ , where  $p$  is a parameter to be determined later. For each copy  $G_i$  we define a subset  $T_i \subseteq T$  of terminals. We then view  $G_i$  as an instance of element-connectivity SNDP, where the connectivity requirements are induced by the set  $T_i$  of terminals as follows. For each  $s, t \in T_i$  the new connectivity requirement is the same as the original one. For all other pairs the connectivity requirements are 0. Observe that for each  $G_i$  the cost of an optimal solution for the induced element-connectivity SNDP instance is at most  $\text{OPT}$ . We then apply the 2-approximation algorithm of [10] to each one of the  $p$  instances of  $k$ -element connectivity problem. Let  $E_i$  denote the set of edges output by the 2-approximation algorithm on the instance defined on the  $G_i$ . Our final solution is  $E^* = E_1 \cup E_2 \cup \dots \cup E_p$ . Clearly, the cost of the solution is at most  $2p \cdot \text{OPT}$ . The main idea of our algorithm is that with the appropriate assignment of terminals to subsets  $T_i$ , the algorithm is guaranteed to produce a feasible solution.

**Definition 2.1** *Let  $\mathcal{M}$  be the input collection of source-sink pairs and  $T$  is the corresponding collection of terminals. We say that a family  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  of subsets of  $T$  is good iff for each source-sink pair  $(s, t) \in \mathcal{M}$ , for each subset  $X \subseteq T$  of size at most  $(k - 1)$ , there is a subset  $T_i$ ,  $1 \leq i \leq p$ , such that  $s, t \in T_i$  and  $X \cap T_i = \emptyset$ .*

We show below that a good family of subsets exists for  $p = O(k^3 \log n)$ , and give a poly-time randomized algorithm to find such a family with high probability. We start by proving that such a family guarantees that the algorithm produces a feasible solution.

**Theorem 2** *Let  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  be a good family of subsets. Then the output  $E^*$  of the above algorithm is a feasible solution to the VC-SNDP instance.*

*Proof.* Let  $(s, t) \in \mathcal{M}$  be any source-sink pair, and let  $X \subseteq V \setminus \{s, t\}$  be any collection of at most  $(r(s, t) - 1) \leq (k - 1)$  vertices. It is enough to show that the removal of  $X$  from the graph induced by  $E^*$  does not separate  $s$  from  $t$ . Let  $X' = X \cap T$ . Since  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  is a good family of subsets, there is some  $T_i$  such that  $s, t \in T_i$  while  $T_i \cap X' = \emptyset$ . Recall that set  $E_i$  of edges defines a feasible solution to the element-connectivity SNDP instance corresponding to  $T_i$ . Then  $X$  is a set of non-terminal vertices with respect to  $T_i$ . Since  $s$  is  $r(s, t)$ -element connected to  $t$  in the graph induced by  $E_i$ , the removal of  $X$  from the graph does not disconnect  $s$  from  $t$ . ■

We now show how to find a good family of subsets  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$ . Let  $p = 128k^3 \log n$ , and set  $q = p/(2k) = 64k^2 \log n$ . Each terminal  $t \in T$  selects uniformly at random  $q$  indices from the set  $\{1, 2, \dots, p\}$  (repetitions are allowed). Let  $\phi(t)$  denote the set of indices chosen by the terminal  $t$ . For each  $1 \leq i \leq p$ , we then define  $T_i = \{t \mid i \in \phi(t)\}$ .

**Theorem 3** *With high probability, the resulting family  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  of subsets is good.*

*Proof.* We extend the definition of  $\phi()$  to an arbitrary subset  $Z$  of vertices by defining  $\phi(Z) = \bigcup_{t \in Z \cap T} \phi(t)$ . Fix any source-sink pair  $(s, t)$ . Let  $X$  be an arbitrary set of at most  $(k-1)$  vertices that does not include  $s, t$ . Note that  $|\phi(X)| \leq (k-1)q < p/2$ . We say that the *bad event*  $\mathcal{E}_1(s, t, X)$  occurs if  $|\phi(s) \cap \phi(X)| \geq \frac{3q}{4}$ . By Chernoff bounds,

$$\Pr[\mathcal{E}_1(s, t, X)] \leq e^{-q/32}.$$

We say that the *bad event*  $\mathcal{E}_2(s, t, X)$  occurs if  $\phi(s) \cap \phi(t) \subseteq \phi(X)$ . We say that the set  $X$  is a *bad set* for a pair  $(s, t)$  if the event  $\mathcal{E}_2(s, t, X)$  occurs. Note that if there is no bad set  $X$  of size at most  $(r(s, t) - 1)$  for every pair  $(s, t) \in \mathcal{M}$ , then  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  is a good family.

We observe that

$$\Pr[\mathcal{E}_2(s, t, X) \mid \overline{\mathcal{E}_1(s, t, X)}] \leq \left(1 - \frac{q/4}{p}\right)^q \leq e^{-q^2/4p} \leq e^{-q/8k}$$

Thus we can bound the probability of the event  $\mathcal{E}_2(s, t, X)$  as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} \Pr[\mathcal{E}_2(s, t, X)] &= \Pr[\mathcal{E}_2(s, t, X) \mid \mathcal{E}_1(s, t, X)]\Pr[\mathcal{E}_1(s, t, X)] + \Pr[\mathcal{E}_2(s, t, X) \mid \overline{\mathcal{E}_1(s, t, X)}]\Pr[\overline{\mathcal{E}_1(s, t, X)}] \\ &\leq \Pr[\mathcal{E}_1(s, t, X)] + \Pr[\mathcal{E}_2(s, t, X) \mid \overline{\mathcal{E}_1(s, t, X)}] \\ &\leq e^{-q/32} + e^{-q/8k} \\ &< n^{-4k}. \end{aligned}$$

Hence, using the union bound, the probability that some bad set  $X$  of size at most  $(k-1)$  exists for any pair  $(s, t)$  can be bounded by  $n^{-2k}$ .  $\blacksquare$

**Remark 1:** We note here that in the proof of Theorem 3, it suffices to ensure that the probability of the event  $\mathcal{E}_2(s, t, X)$  is bounded by  $|T|^{-4k}$  instead of  $n^{-4k}$ . To see this, observe that we need only to consider the sets  $X$  that consist of terminal vertices. Moreover, the total number of source-sink pairs is bounded by  $|T|^2$ .

Combining Theorems 2 and 3 gives the following corollary:

**Corollary 1** *There is a randomized  $O(k^3 \log n)$ -approximation algorithm for VC-SNDP.*

**Remark 2:** We also note that this result implies that the integrality gap of the standard set-pair relaxation for VC-SNDP [12] has an integrality gap of  $O(k^3 \log n)$ . This follows from the fact that the 2-approximation result of [10] also establishes an upper bound of 2 on the integrality gap of the set-pair relaxation for element-connectivity. A lower bound of  $\tilde{\Omega}(k^{1/3})$  is known on the integrality gap of the set-pair relaxation for VC-SNDP [4].

**Remark 3:** We notice that our algorithm carries over to the node-weighted version of VC-SNDP, and in particular an  $\alpha$ -approximation algorithm for the node-weighted element-connectivity SNDP would imply an  $O(k^3 \alpha \log |T|)$ -approximation for the node-weighted VC-SNDP.

### 3 The Algorithm for Single-Source VC-SNDP

In this section we show that an  $O(k^2 \log n)$ -approximation algorithm can be easily achieved using the above ideas for the single-source version of VC-SNDP. Several algorithms achieving similar approximation factors have been proposed recently [7, 6, 19]. While the algorithm and the analysis proposed here are elementary, we make use of the (relatively involved) 2-approximation algorithm of [10] as a black box. The algorithms of [7, 6] have the advantage that they are presented “from scratch”, using only elementary tools, and when viewed as such they are rather simple.

The input to the single-source VC-SNDP is a graph  $G = (V, E)$  with a special vertex  $s$  called the source, and a subset  $T$  of vertices called terminals. Additionally, for each  $t \in T$  we are given a connectivity requirement  $r(s, t) \leq k$ . The goal is to select a minimum-cost subset  $E' \subseteq E$  of edges, such that in the graph induced by  $E'$  every terminal  $t \in T$  is  $r(s, t)$ -vertex connected to  $s$ . This is clearly a special case of VC-SNDP, where the source-sink pairs are  $\{(s, t)\}_{t \in T}$ . As before, we create a family  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  of subsets of terminals,  $T_i \subseteq T$  for all  $1 \leq i \leq p$ . We also create  $p$  copies  $G_1, \dots, G_p$ , and for each  $G_i$  we solve the element-connectivity SNDP instance with connectivity requirements induced by terminals in  $T_i$ . Let  $E_i$  be the 2-approximate solution to instance  $G_i$ . Our final solution is  $E^* = \bigcup_{i=1}^p E_i$ . Clearly, the cost of the solution is at most  $2p(\text{OPT})$ .

**Definition 3.1** A family  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  of subsets of terminals is good iff for each terminal  $t \in T$ , for each subset  $X \subseteq T$  of at most  $(k - 1)$  terminals, there is  $T_i$  such that  $t \in T_i$  and  $T_i \cap X = \emptyset$ .

**Theorem 4** If  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  is good family of subsets then the above algorithm produces a feasible solution.

*Proof.* Let  $t \in T$  and let  $X \subseteq V \setminus \{s, t\}$  be any subset of at most  $r(s, t) - 1 \leq (k - 1)$  vertices excluding  $s$  and  $t$ . It is enough to prove that the removal of  $X$  from the graph induced by  $E^*$  does not disconnect  $s$  from  $t$ . Let  $X' = X \cap T$ . Since  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  is a good

family, there is some  $T_i$  such that  $t \in T_i$  and  $T_i \cap X' = \emptyset$ . Consider the solution  $E_i$  to the corresponding  $k$ -element connectivity instance. Since vertices of  $X$  are non-terminal vertices for the instance  $G_i$ , their removal from the graph induced by  $E_i$  does not disconnect  $s$  from  $t$ . ■

Let  $p = 4k^2 \log n$  and  $q = p/(2k) = 2k \log n$ . Each terminal  $t \in T$  selects  $q$  indices from the set  $\{1, 2, \dots, p\}$  uniformly at random with repetitions. Let  $\phi(t)$  denote the set of indices chosen by the terminal  $t$ . For each  $1 \leq i \leq p$ , we then define  $T_i = \{t \mid i \in \phi(t)\}$ .

**Theorem 5** *With high probability, the resulting family of subsets  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  is good.*

*Proof.* Let  $t \in T$  be any terminal and let  $X$  be any subset of at most  $r(s, t) - 1 \leq (k - 1)$  terminals. As before, we extend the function  $\phi$  to an arbitrary subset  $Z$  of vertices by defining  $\phi(Z) = \bigcup_{t \in Z \cap T} \phi(t)$ . We say that *bad event*  $\mathcal{E}(t, X)$  occurs iff  $\phi(t) \subseteq \phi(X)$ . The probability of  $\mathcal{E}(t, X)$  is at most

$$\left(1 - \frac{kq}{p}\right)^q = \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)^q \leq n^{-2k}$$

Therefore, with high probability the event  $\mathcal{E}(t, X)$  does not happen for any  $t, X$  and then  $\{T_1, \dots, T_p\}$  is good. ■

**Corollary 2** *There is a randomized  $O(k^2 \log n)$ -approximation algorithm for single-source VC-SNDP.*

## Acknowledgements

We thank Chandra Chekuri for his helpful comments on an earlier version of this paper.

## References

- [1] A. Agrawal, P. N. Klein, and R. Ravi. When trees collide: An approximation algorithm for the generalized steiner problem on networks. *SIAM Journal of Computing*, 24(3):440–456, 1995.
- [2] J. Cheriyan, S. Vempala, and A. Vetta. An approximation algorithm for the minimum-cost  $k$ -vertex connected subgraph. *SIAM Journal of Computing*, 32(4):1050–1055, 2003.
- [3] J. Cheriyan, S. Vempala, and A. Vetta. Network design via iterative rounding of setpair relaxations. *Combinatorica*, 26(3):255–275, 2006.
- [4] T. Chakraborty, J. Chuzhoy, and S. Khanna. Network Design for Vertex Connectivity. In *Proceedings of ACM Symposium on Theory of Computing (STOC)*, 2008.

- [5] C. Chekuri and N. Korula. Single-Sink Network Design with Vertex Connectivity Requirements. FSTTCS, 2008.
- [6] C. Chekuri and N. Korula. A Graph Reduction Step Preserving Element -Connectivity and Applications. Manuscript, 2008.
- [7] J. Chuzhoy and S. Khanna. Algorithms for single-source vertex connectivity. In *Proceedings of the IEEE Symposium on Foundations of Computer Science (FOCS)*, 2009.
- [8] J. Fakcharoenphol and B. Laekhanukit. An  $O(\log^2 k)$ -approximation algorithm for the  $k$ -vertex connected subgraph problem. In *Proceedings of ACM Symposium on Theory of Computing (STOC)*, 2008.
- [9] L. Fleischer. A 2-Approximation for Minimum Cost  $\{0, 1, 2\}$  Vertex Connectivity. IPCO, pp. 115-129, 2001.
- [10] L. Fleischer, K. Jain, and D. P. Williamson. An Iterative Rounding 2-Approximation Algorithm for the Element Connectivity Problem. In *Proceedings of the IEEE Symposium on Foundations of Computer Science (FOCS)*, pp. 339-347, 2001.
- [11] L. Fleischer, K. Jain, and D. P. Williamson. Iterative rounding 2-approximation algorithms for minimum cost vertex connectivity problems. *Journal of Computer and System Sciences*, 72(5):838–867, 2006.
- [12] A. Frank and T. Jordan. Minimal edge-coverings of pairs of sets. *Journal of Combinatorial Theory, Series B*, 65(1):73–110, 1995.
- [13] K. Jain. Factor 2 approximation algorithm for the generalized steiner network problem. In *Proceedings of the thirty-ninth annual IEEE Foundations of Computer Science (FOCS)*, pages 448–457, 1998.
- [14] K. Jain, I. Mandoiu, V.V. Vazirani and D.P. Williamson. A primal-dual schema based approximation algorithm for the element connectivity problem. *J. Algorithms* 45(1), pp. 1-15.
- [15] G. Kortsarz, R. Krauthgamer, and J. R. Lee. Hardness of approximation for vertex-connectivity network design problems. *SIAM Journal of Computing*, 33(3):704–720, 2004.
- [16] G. Kortsarz and Z. Nutov. Approximating node connectivity problems via set covers. *Algorithmica*, 37(2):75–92, 2003.
- [17] G. Kortsarz and Z. Nutov. Approximating  $k$ -node connected subgraphs via critical graphs. *SIAM Journal of Computing*, 35(1):247–257, 2005.



- [18] Y. Lando and Z. Nutov. Inapproximability of Survivable Networks APPROX 2008, *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, 5171, pp. 146-152.
- [19] Z. Nutov. A note on Rooted Survivable Networks. Manuscript. <http://www.openu.ac.il/home/nutov/R-SND.pdf>.
- [20] Z. Nutov. An almost  $O(\log k)$ -approximation for  $k$ -connected subgraphs. Manuscript. <http://www.openu.ac.il/home/nutov/k-conn-best.pdf>.
- [21] R. Ravi and D. P. Williamson. An approximation algorithm for minimum-cost vertex-connectivity problems. *Algorithmica*, 18(1):21–43, 1997.